



**SPECIAL BOARD MEETING
Monday, April 14, 2014 at 6:00 p.m.
Catholic Central Secondary School
441 Tecumseh Rd. E, Windsor, ON**

AGENDA

1. Call To Order
2. Opening Prayer
3. Recording of Attendance
4. Approval of Agenda
5. Disclosure of Interest - Pursuant to the Municipal Conflict of Interest Act.
6. Communications:
 - a. Report: Director of Education's Report on the Accommodation Review Study for the Central Windsor Area, including Catholic Central Secondary School, Immaculate Conception and St. Angela Catholic Elementary Schools (P. Picard) 1-10
7. Delegations:
 - a. Delegations Regarding Accommodation Review Committee's and Director of Education's Report on the Accommodation Review Study for the Central Windsor Area, including Catholic Central Secondary School, Immaculate Conception and St. Angela Catholic Elementary Schools
Individuals or groups wishing to make a presentation at the meeting are asked to contact Executive Assistant Beth Marshall by noon the day prior to the meeting at (519) 253-2481, extension 1289 or beth_marshall@wecdsb.on.ca. Information about the Board's accommodation review process and all reports relevant to the review are available on the Board's website at: www.wecdsb.on.ca. The public is also invited to provide written input to Paul A. Picard, Director of Education at the Windsor Essex Catholic Education Centre, 1325 California Avenue, Windsor, ON N9B 3Y6 or director@wecdsb.on.ca.

No Delegation requests were received.
8. Closing Prayer
9. Adjournment

Barbara Holland
Board Chairperson

Paul A. Picard
Director of Education



1325 California Avenue
Windsor, ON N9B 3Y6
CHAIRPERSON: Barbara Holland
DIRECTOR OF EDUCATION: Paul A. Picard

**Special Board
Meeting Date:
April 14, 2014**

BOARD REPORT

Public **In-Camera**

PRESENTED FOR: Information Approval

PRESENTED BY: Senior Administration

SUBMITTED BY: Paul A. Picard, Director of Education

SUBJECT: **Director of Education's Report on the Accommodation Review Study for the Central Windsor Area, including Catholic Central Secondary School, Immaculate Conception and St. Angela Catholic Elementary Schools**

RECOMMENDATION:

That the Board receive as information the Director's Report on the Accommodation Review Study for the Central Windsor Area, including Catholic Central Secondary School, Immaculate Conception and St. Angela Catholic Elementary Schools; and

That the Board receive public input concerning the Director's Report, and the matters that are addressed in it and in the Accommodation Review Committee's (ARC's) Report.

SYNOPSIS:

The work of the Accommodation Review Committee (ARC), established by Ministry of Education Supervisor Norbert Hartmann on May 28, 2013, to study, report and make recommendations on future pupil accommodation options for the Central Windsor area, including Catholic Central Secondary School, St. Angela and Immaculate Conception Catholic Elementary schools, has been completed. The Committee submitted its final report to the Director of Education on March 5, 2014 and to the Board as information on March 25, 2014. Pursuant to Board Procedure Pr A: 05 Pupil Accommodation Review, the Director is required to review the recommendations of the ARC and to report to the Board on the results of the public consultation process, with analysis and recommendations. The Board will hold a special meeting to receive the Director's report and to receive public input concerning the Director's report, and the matters addressed in it and in the Accommodation Review Committee's Report.

BACKGROUND COMMENTS:

On May 28, 2013, Supervisor Hartmann approved proceeding with the establishment of an Accommodation Review Committee to lead a public consultation process in studying,

reporting and making recommendations on future accommodation options for the Central Windsor area, including Catholic Central Secondary School, St. Angela and Immaculate Conception Catholic Elementary Schools.

At the first Committee meeting on September 10, 2013, Administration provided to ARC members a background information package and a customized School Information Profile for each school in the study to support them in their mandate. The background information package and profiles are attached as appendices to this report.

At the first Committee meeting, the ARC was also provided a copy of the Committee's Terms of Reference, as detailed within Administrative Procedure Pr A: 05 Pupil Accommodation.

Upon review of the minutes of all Committee and public consultation meetings (which are attached as appendices), it is evident that the Committee has been diligent in following its mandate to conduct a comprehensive and thorough public study. The Committee conducted four public consultation meetings, pursuant to its Terms of Reference. The Committee also invited the community to provide written input to the Director of Education. Written input received, as well as Administration's responses to Committee or community inquiries were attached as appendices to the minutes of the meetings.

Senior Administration has carefully considered the ARC's Report delivered to the Director of Education on March 5, 2014, as well as the minutes and appendices reflecting input from the communities.

The Enrolment Projections and Demographic Trends Report of December 9, 2013, prepared for the Board by Watson and Associates, Economists Limited, which was shared with the Committee, was helpful in informing both the Committee's and Administration's recommendations.

The Committee's Report provided a detailed analysis of six options, which included feedback from a public consultation study that examined the potential negative and positive impacts of each accommodation option to students, the Board, the local communities and economy. This report has been of great value to Administration in formulating the following recommendations:

RECOMMENDATION FOR CATHOLIC CENTRAL SECONDARY SCHOOL

Of the six options considered by the Committee, all involved the closure of Catholic Central Secondary School. The Committee was clear in reporting, that due to the school community being located in an aging facility, on a cramped site, there is community concern that the students of Catholic Central are not receiving the variety of programming and amenities that are enjoyed by other secondary students in the system.

Administration shares the concerns of the Committee. In the Capital Plans submitted to the Ministry of Education in the last two years, the Board has listed required funding for a new facility for Catholic Central as one of its highest capital priorities, with consideration for the following:

Secondary School	MPAC Site Size (Acres)	Current Enrolment (FTE)	OTG / Utilization	Original Construction Date	10 Year Renewal / FCI
Catholic Central HS	3.02	776	897/ 86%	1929	\$13,053,531/ 56.1%
F.J. Brennan HS	14.57	645	1065/ 61%	1953	\$9,375,586/ 33.3%
Assumption College HS	23.40	581	834/ 70%	1953	\$5,548,264/ 25.5%
St. Joseph's HS	19.78	964	984/ 98%	2006	\$5,733,910/ 21.8%
Cardinal Carter HS	21.01	582	744/ 78%	1993	\$6,349,088/ 32.3%
St. Anne HS	32.05	1291	1302/ 99%	2008	\$6,331,841/ 18.5%
St. Thomas of Villanova HS	54.8	1148	1281/ 90%	1987	\$9,049,325/ 27.5%
Holy Names HS	20.71	1298	1056/ 123%	1967	\$14,096,385/ 50.8%

- OTG Capacity means On the Ground Capacity determined by Ministry of Education established class sizes.
- The Utilization Rate is a Ministry of Education calculation determined by dividing the Enrolment by the OTG Capacity.
- The Facility Condition Index (FCI) is the renewal requirement of asset divided by the replacement cost of asset x 100. According to the Ministry of Education a FCI less than 5% is "good", between 5 and 10% is "fair", between 10-30% is "poor", and greater than 30% is "critical".
- Facility Condition Index (FCI), Replacement Value and 10 Year Renewal Costs were provided from the Ministry of Education's Total Capital Planning Solution (TCPS) database.

*NOTE: St. Anne HS & St. Joseph's HS have not been evaluated by TCPS. The 10 year Renewal/FCI is an estimate based on minimal information within the TCPS system

As indicated in the above comparison chart, Catholic Central is the oldest facility; the Board facing the potential challenge of addressing 10 year renewal needs of possibly \$13,053,531 to maintain the building; this bringing it into the Ministry's "critical" range for becoming prohibitive to repair (with a replacement value estimated at \$23,269,100).

The site on which Catholic Central is located is significantly smaller than the site of any other secondary school in the system (1/5th the size of the next smallest secondary facility site). The location is essentially "land locked", with no adjoining properties allowing potential for expansion.

In comparing current enrolment numbers, Catholic Central is in the bottom half of the secondary schools in the system. The enrolment forecast prepared by Watson and Associates indicates a decline for a period moving forward, with a low of 736 students by 2018/2019 (with a projection for subsequent enrolment increase).

With consideration for the above comparison and analysis, and hearing the concerns voiced by the community, it is Administration's recommendation that the optimal accommodation option for the students of Catholic Central would be construction of a new facility. However,

although the Ministry has indicated that if property can be obtained at a reasonable cost, it would consider funding of a new facility; those funds have not as yet been formally confirmed. Acknowledging that the Catholic Central facility cannot continue to operate into the long term, alternative accommodation options must be considered for the students of Catholic Central in the event that Ministry funding is not realized. Administration, therefore recommends the following:

RECOMMENDATION:

That Catholic Central Secondary School be scheduled for closure in June 2016 with the Board continuing to pursue Ministry of Education funding for the construction of a new facility at a location that considers the best interests of the students, families and communities within the Central Windsor Area;

That the Board continue to consider the concerns voiced by the community as it examines potential properties for the possible construction of a new Catholic Central, and that should funding be secured, a Transition Committee be established, composed of Catholic Central staff, parents and students, to consult on the development of floor/site plans for the facility; and

That if Ministry funding is not realized for the construction of a new facility, Catholic Central shall be closed effective June 2016, and the boundaries of Assumption College Catholic High School, F.J. Brennan High School, and Holy Names High School, shall be adjusted effective September 2016, to accommodate the students currently within the Catholic Central School boundary, with any necessary additions to the three schools being determined before closure of Catholic Central and sufficient funding being solicited from the Ministry to accommodate Catholic Central students at these schools

SHOULD MINISTRY FUNDING BE SECURED FOR CONSTRUCTION OF A NEW FACILITY:

Administration agrees with the Committee in their endorsement of a new facility that would allow for expansion and enhanced programming. It is noted that Catholic Central is one of only two Board secondary schools in the system which is projected for enrolment increase in the 15 year projection prepared by Watson and Associates. Assumption is projected to experience a 22% increase in enrolment by 2027/2028, while Catholic Central is projected to experience a 56% increase (this projection for enrolment at Catholic Central is based on the school community continuing to be accommodated in the existing facility).

Administration also agrees with the Committee in their assessment that building a new facility could enhance potential enrolment, particularly if that building is located within an area of high density population, and that this in turn would allow for more varied programming available for students.

At the outset of the ARC study, Administration provided the Committee with the following possible option for consideration by the Committee and the community:

Build a new Catholic Central at the Windsor Arena Site at McDougall and Wyandotte; Consolidate St. Angela and Immaculate Conception Catholic Elementary Schools in a new school building at the same site, with the high school and elementary school sharing a field house (renovated Windsor Water World building)

This option was initially presented as a possible accommodation option for the students in the Central Windsor Area for the following reasons:

- It would provide a new facility for both elementary and secondary students and potential for enhanced programming for all.
- It addressed the challenges faced by declining enrolment and the Board having to incur the potential renewal costs arising out of the continued maintenance of three separate facilities.
- The City of Windsor, in seeing the benefits of maintaining a school within the City Core, has offered to donate the property to the Board. The City has also offered to donate additional land which already contains parking facilities, at no cost to the Board.
- This location allows the Board to offer families a Catholic High School within the downtown area. Administration agrees with the representatives of the Glengarry-Marentette Renewal Initiative, who provided input in the ARC study, indicating that a high school in this location could create a “social anchor”, keeping families in the downtown neighbourhood.
- This location would also address the concerns for costs of transportation that many families in the downtown area would face if having to travel to secondary schools more distant from the central core area. The location would allow for a larger number of “walkers” from the downtown area neighbourhoods.
- As a “social anchor”, a school at this site would provide potential for community partnerships for shared use, allowing students in the downtown area greater access to a greater variety of programming and extra-curricular activities.

COMMUNITY CONCERNS FOR AVAILABLE SPACE AT THE WINDSOR ARENA SITE:

Over the course of the study, there were numerous concerns expressed for the size of the Windsor Arena site and whether it could accommodate both a high school and an elementary school (or schools). The concerns raised included the potential for limited access to resources, including gym, library, and green space.

In reviewing these concerns, Administration is confident that the Windsor Arena site, comprising approximately 6.5 acres (double the size of the current Catholic Central site), including the extensive green space of Glengarry Park, would provide more than ample space for the construction of a “new” Catholic Central High School. Further, with the commitment from the City that parking will be made available to the Board on a neighbouring property, the full acreage can be dedicated to “school” use. With the forecast for enrolment for Catholic Central not showing an increase until post-2019, in the short term, a portion of the Glengarry parkland would be available for shared use with the community.

There were also concerns raised that the Windsor Arena site was not large enough to accommodate a “regulation” athletic field. Administration notes that none of the Board’s secondary school sites accommodate a true “regulation” field. They are all limited somewhat by length requirements, “end-zone” requirements etc. The Windsor Arena site, would allow for a smaller field than that at the other secondary sites, but would be large

enough to accommodate a practice field for both physical education classes and school athletic teams. Further the location of the site would allow for the joint use of neighbourhood venues to host inter-school competitions.

Acknowledging the concerns of the community for locating the elementary schools at this site, but also recognizing the potential benefits of this site to secondary students and their families in the Central Windsor Area, Administration would recommend that the Board continue to investigate this site as a feasible and viable option for the construction of a new high school, but consider other accommodation options to address the needs of the elementary schools.

PURSUING A NEW FACILITY SHOULD MINISTRY FUNDING BE SECURED:

With the deferral of the closure of Catholic Central to June 2016, the Board would continue to consider the best location for a new high school, should funds be realized, including the proposal of Mr. Montaleone presented within the consultation study. That proposal, however, as presented, was contingent on the acquisition of Wigle Park in order to allow sufficient acreage. The Wigle Park acquisition was also recommended in the ARC Report. The City of Windsor has recently confirmed that there is no plan to sell the park.

Administration also recommends that the Board continue to consider the concerns voiced by the community as it examines potential properties for the possible construction of a new Catholic Central, and that should funding be secured, a Transition Committee be established, composed of Catholic Central staff, parents and students, to consult on the development of floor/site plans for the facility. The Catholic Central community has expressed great enthusiasm for a better facility for students and families in the area, and as evidenced in the ARC report, has formulated very well thought-out, valuable suggestions, for such a facility.

SHOULD MINISTRY FUNDING NOT BE SECURED FOR THE CONSTRUCTION OF A "NEW" CATHOLIC CENTRAL:

A "new" Catholic Central is dependent upon Ministry funding. Although Administration is in agreement, that the best accommodation option for Central Windsor would be a new facility, if funding is not confirmed, Administration recommends the closure of the school effective June 2016, with boundary adjustments for the neighbouring secondary schools, including F.J. Brennan, Holy Names, and Assumption, to accommodate the secondary students in the Central Windsor Area.

Administration has considered the concerns of the community for the option of accommodating all Catholic Central students at F.J. Brennan, particularly the concerns for transportation, and in reviewing the student distribution boundary maps, believes that boundary adjustments at F.J. Brennan, Holy Names, and Assumption would provide alternative accommodation options for the students currently within the Catholic Central boundary, with the following forecasted potential available pupil spaces:

Assumption College HS: Projected for 2016: 628 students
 Current OTG: 834
 Potential Available Pupil Spaces September 2016: 206

F.J. Brennan HS: Projected for 2016: 656 students*
 Current OTG: 1065
 Potential Available Pupil Spaces September 2016: 409

Holy Names HS: Projected for 2016: 1344 students
 Current OTG: 1056
 Currently Over-utilized – temporary accommodation through use of portable/portapacks – declining enrolment forecasted to begin 2019 and by 2025 at a low of 967 (with potential 89 surplus pupil spaces)

Potential Available pupil spaces in September 2016 615*
 (at the above mentioned schools)

Projected enrolment at Catholic Central for September 2016 799
 (Accommodations would include use of portables/portapacks)

*Dependent upon Accommodation Review of Riverside Area family of schools

RECOMMENDATION FOR ST. ANGELA AND IMMACULATE CONCEPTION CATHOLIC ELEMENTARY SCHOOLS

The Board's challenges in maintaining both St. Angela and Immaculate Conception:

As indicated above, Administration in hearing the concerns of the Community, does not recommend that St. Angela and/or Immaculate Conception be moved to the potential "new" site for Catholic Central. However, the Board still must address the following challenges in maintaining both schools.

As set out in Administration's Report to the Board on March 25, 2014, the Board continues to face the following budget pressures and challenges:

- The Board is projected to graduate 1,097 more students at the end of 2014-15 than the number of students projected to be enrolled in JK during the year. It is evident from the data that the downward trend in enrolment is projected to continue year-over-year. If the projected Junior Kindergarten enrolment for 2014-15 stays fixed for each year into the future and no other factors change, the Board would decline to a nominal enrolment of 12,600 in 2027-28, a drop of 7,674 pupils or 38%.
- 63% of WECDSB's elementary schools are using less than 85% of the available space.
- There is currently excess capacity of 4,364 spaces or 18% across WECDSB's entire system. This represents an approximate equivalent of 10 average-sized elementary schools that would have to close for the Board to address this excess capacity.
- Schools with excess capacity are still subject to the same fixed costs of school operations, such as utilities and maintenance. Because space is underutilized however, the schools do not receive enough per-pupil funding through basic

foundation grants to cover these fixed costs. To address this problem, the Ministry provides boards with top-up funding in the School Facility Operations and Renewal Grants. The top-up increases the Board's revenue for up to 15% of the excess capacity. For example, a school with a utilization rate of 60% would be treated as if it were operating at 75%; a school with a utilization rate of 80% would be treated as if it were operating at 95%; and schools over 85% utilization are fully topped up (i.e. treated as if they are operating at 100%). Any school operating under 85% utilization is not generating full school operations and renewal grant funding. Therefore the Board is not maximizing the funding it could be allocated, which is causing a continuing budget pressure

- In the 2013-14 Revised Budget Estimates, 11% (almost \$2.5M) of WECDSB's total school operations and school renewal funding is dedicated to funding empty spaces. Across the province, this figure is 13% or \$300M, an amount which, if fewer empty pupil places existed, could be freed up by the Ministry for improved student achievement.

In its announcement of March 27, 2014, respecting Grants for Student Needs Funding and Regulations for the 2014-15 school year, the Ministry of Education, acknowledging the costs to the Education system of operating underutilized school spaces, reported on the School Board Efficiencies and Modernization (SBEM) Initiative which was introduced in the 2013 Provincial Budget. This initiative includes changes to the top-up funding for underutilized schools. Under the new initiative, an underutilized school facility, at a utilization of over 65 percent, will receive 15% top up funding, but only to a maximum of 95% of capacity funding. Schools at or below 65 percent utilization, will be provided with top-up funding that recognizes only 10% of their excess capacity. The Ministry estimates this will result in a savings of \$42.4 million to the education system, which it has committed to reinvesting a portion towards assisting Boards with the capital costs of new schools, retrofits and additions to support consolidations.

With these changes effective in 2014- 2015, the cost for the Board of continuing to operate underutilized schools, will be increasing.

Immaculate Conception and St. Angela Catholic Elementary Schools:

With an on the ground capacity of 449 pupil spaces and current enrolment of 330, the St. Angela facility is currently utilized at 74% and the Board does not receive full School Operations and Renewal Grant funding for the facility, causing a continuing budget pressure to the system.

The projections of Watson and Associates create a further concern, in that St. Angela is forecast to experience consistent declining enrolment through the 15 year projection, with a corresponding decrease in utilization and increase in budget pressure to the system throughout the period, to a projected low in 2027/2028 of 274 students (an estimated 61% utilization rate).

Although Immaculate Conception (ICS) is currently at 101% utilization (OTG of 190 with enrolment of 192), it is also forecast to experience declining enrolment to a projected low in 2027/2028 of 162 students (an estimated 85% utilization rate).

There is currently a surplus of pupil spaces at St. Angela, which is expected to increase with declining enrolment. A consolidation of Immaculate Conception at the St. Angela facility

would realize one facility, operating with full Ministry funding, and alleviate the pressure placed on the system in continuing to operate St. Angela as an underutilized school.

Concerns Raised by the Community:

Closure of Immaculate Conception, with a consolidation of school communities at St. Angela, would address the challenges faced by this family of schools and could provide accommodations for both school communities that allow for quality programming consistent with other schools in our system.

However, Administration in reviewing the concerns raised by the community respecting the possible closure of Immaculate Conception, notes certain considerations unique to this family of schools, that it recommend be given weight by the Board in arriving at an appropriate accommodation decision, including the following highlighted by the ARC:

- “ICS has recently relocated and now they are being asked to do so again.
- ICS currently draws much of its population from the St. Alphonsus and Caldean churches. These affiliations and religious networking ties would be lost.
- ICS students utilize nearby downtown facilities such as the YMCA to augment and enrich their lives. In this option these affiliations would be lost or minimized by this amalgamation.
- Investment to the downtown infrastructure enriches the lives of all Windsor citizens and one of our valuable resources would now be lost.”

Administration also notes the benefits to these school communities in having a Catholic Elementary School located both East and West of Ouellette Avenue, particularly as they relate to transportation (a merge at St. Angela would require an additional bus for the ICS students).

Balancing consideration for the concerns raised by the Community and the Board's concerns for a continuing and possible increasing budget pressure to the system in maintaining St. Angela and Immaculate Conception as separate facilities. Administration recommends the following as Accommodation Options for Immaculate Conception and St. Angela Catholic Elementary Schools:

RECOMMENDATION:

That Immaculate Conception Catholic Elementary School be closed if and when enrolment at Immaculate Conception is such that the student population at the school could be accommodated in surplus space at St. Angela, without the need for an addition to the St. Angela facility; at which time the student population would be consolidated at the St. Angela site;

That the Board annually advise the communities of the enrolment forecasts for the upcoming school year by February of the prior year; Should the forecasts in any given year indicate that enrolment is such that Immaculate Conception can be accommodated at St. Angela for the following school year, without the need for an addition to the St. Angela facility, Immaculate Conception shall be closed at the end of that school year and the student population consolidated at the St. Angela site effective September of the following school year; and

That should Immaculate Conception be closed, an Integration Committee composed of representatives from both school communities be immediately established in order to plan for and implement the positive integration of students and staff into the new merged communities.

IN SUMMARY

Administration commends the ARC and the communities it represented for conducting and participating in a comprehensive and thorough public consultation study. Their input was invaluable to Administration throughout its analysis and formulation of its recommendation.

Administration's recommendation is respectfully submitted for community feedback.

FINANCIAL IMPACT:

As detailed within Report.

TIMELINES:

As detailed within Report.

APPENDICES:

All appendices to this report can be found on the Board's public website at www.wecdsb.on.ca by clicking on "Accommodation Review Committees".

REPORT REVIEWED BY:

<input type="checkbox"/>	EXECUTIVE COUNCIL:	Review Date:	--
<input type="checkbox"/>	EXECUTIVE SUPERINTENDENT:	Approval Date:	--
<input checked="" type="checkbox"/>	DIRECTOR OF EDUCATION:	Approval Date:	March 31, 2014